### Case 1:19-cv-03377-LAP Document 72 Filed 10/25/19 Page 1 of 5

October 24, 2019

Case 1:19-cv-03377-LAP Document 71 Filed 10/24/19 Page 1 of 2

USDC SDNY Todd&WeldLLP DOCUMENT ELECTROMICALLY FILED DATE FILED: 10-2

Howard M. Cooper E-mail: hcooper@toddweld.com

WIAECF

Counsel Shall confer with Haintiff's Honorable Loretta A. Preska
United States District Court
Southern District of New York he or she may inform the Court set 500 Pearl Street New York, NY 10007-1312

Re:

Giuffre v. Dershowitz

Case No.: 19-cv-03377-LAP

AITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

10/25/19

Dear Judge Preska:

Pursuant to Local Civil Rule 37.2 and Rule 2.A of Your Honor's Individual Practices, Defendant Alan Dershowitz respectfully requests that the Court hold a pre-motion conference with respect to Professor Dershowitz's request for certain limited, narrowly tailored, pre-Answer discovery.

Specifically, Professor Dershowitz intends to request that Plaintiff Virginia Giuffre be required to immediately produce the following two items which are readily available to her:

- The transcript(s) and exhibits of her deposition(s) in Giuffre v. Maxwell, 15-cv-07433; and
- The transcript and exhibits of her deposition in Edwards et al. v. Dershowitz.

These materials contain Giuffre's prior sworn testimony about the very accusations and events at issue in this case. They will be of substantial assistance in Professor Dershowitz's preparation of his forthcoming counterclaims. In the depositions, Giuffre faced cross-examination about her history with Jeffrey Epstein, the genesis of her accusations against Professor Dershowitz, her interactions with journalists, and her efforts to profit from her story. As one example only, the transcripts and exhibits will establish that it was British journalist Sharon Churcher who in 2011 mentioned Professor Dershowitz's name to Giuffre, suggesting that she include him in her book, even though she had failed to mention him in her manuscript or in her interviews with Churcher. This smoking gun evidence actually states that although there was "no proof" that Professor Dershowitz engaged in any sexual misconduct, he was a "good name for [Giuffre's] book" and that Giuffre "probably met him when he was hanging [o]ut w[ith] [Epstein]." Ex. A (emphasis supplied).

As we know Your Honor is aware, the Second Circuit in Brown v. Maxwell, 929 F.3d 41 (2d Cir. 2019), ordered the immediate unsealing of the entire summary judgment record in the Giuffre v. Maxwell matter (including the emails attached hereto as Ex. A), and remanded the case to the District Court, where it was subsequently assigned to Your Honor, for the unsealing of additional materials. In the Second Circuit, a party making a request for pre-answer discovery must show "that the requests are reasonable under the circumstances." Keybank, Nat'l Assoc. v. Quality Pay-Roll Sys., Inc., WL 1720461, at \*4 (E.D.N.Y. June 22, 2006). Professor Dershowitz's request satisfies this reasonableness

## Case 1:19-cv-03377-LAP Document 72 Filed 10/25/19 Page 2 of 5

Case 1:19-cv-03377-LAP Document 71 Filed 10/24/19 Page 2 of 2



Hon. Loretta A. Preska October 24, 2019 Page 2 of 2

standard because it is targeted at a small and discrete set of documents which are plainly discoverable, and which can be produced forthwith with no burden whatsoever to Plaintiff.

Professor Dershowitz respectfully requests that the Court hold a pre-motion conference with respect to this matter, or otherwise order Giuffre to produce these materials forthwith. In order that these materials may be incorporated into his Answer and Counterclaims, Professor Dershowitz further requests that he be given seven (7) days from the date of production of these materials (if ordered) to file his Answer and Counterclaims.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Howard M. Cooper Howard M. Cooper

HMC/lm

cc: All counsel of record, via ECF

Case 1:19-cv-03377-LAP Document 71-1 Filed 10/24/19 Page 1 of 3

# Exhibit A

## Case 1:19-cv-03377-LAP Document 72 Filed 10/25/19 Page 4 of 5

sharon chincheng manohatha ay count gray and a gray and

From: Virginia Giuffre Sent: Thur 5/12/2011 2:21:43 AM	and of state of to the		
Importance: Normal			
Subject: Re: Good News!! Received: Thur 5/12/2011 2:21:43 AM			
Thanks again Shazza, I'm bringing down the house w	ith this book!!!		
хохо Јеппа			
On Wed, 11/5/11, Sharon.Churcher@mallousm	iday.co.ak <i><sharon.churchar< i="">(g</sharon.churchar<></i>	gmailonsunday.co.uk	> wrote;
From: Sharon.Churcher@mailonsunday.co.uk <shar Subject: Re: Good News!!</shar 	ou.Churcher@mailousunday.co.	uk>	
To: "Virginia Giuffre" < Received: Wédnesday, 11 May, 2011, 4:17 PM			
Don't forget Alan DershowitzJE's buddy and lawyer pitch as he repped Claus von Bulow and a movie was casetitle was Reversal of Fortune. We all suspect A no proof of that, you probably met him when he was he	made about that Ian is a pedo and tho		
From:			
*** A WAR A M M MANAGA MANAGA A MANAGA MANAG			
Virginia Giuffro   1		ng ang ang ang ang ang ang ang ang ang a	and the desires of material two pro-engines.
71 PM AMARINA AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND A		د چه خواه مینی به چه خواه در خواه در خواه در به خواه در به	
To:    >			
Sharon Churcher		و المستقل المستواح في المفتحة في ساعد الله هنا و المستقل المست	M4444444
A			
Date:			
[10/05/2011 23:00 GDT			
			,
Subject:   			
Good News!!			•
		च न्यू पर विकास की कारण की हो जा है जो की	Annual est an est del herrit, vil de
Hi Sharon,	,		
Hello gorgeous, I hope this message comes to you on a I took your advice about what to offer Sandra and she drawing up a contract through her agent right now and	accepted. Were		
	A many or many		

To:

From:

### Case 1:19-cv-03377-LAP Document 72 Filed 10/25/19 Page 5 of 5

Casasel 98e28633776came my deadline. Just wondering it you have any it	HDOMMMOBIOW/2019  &6280728/199ageage 85of 3			
you and I were doing interviews about the J.E story. I wanted to put the				
names of some of these assholes, oops, I meant to say, pedo's, that J.E				
sent me to. With everything going on my brain feels like mush and it would				
be a great deal of help!				
Having fun sweetic?				
Thanks,				
Jenna				
This email has been scanned by the MessageLabs Email Security System.				
For more information please visit http://www.messagolabs.com/email				

This c-mail and any attached files are intended for the named addressee only. It contains information, which may be confidential and legally privileged and also protected by copyright. Unless you are the named addressee (or authorised to receive for the addressee) you may not copy or use it, or disclose it to anyone else. If you received it in error please notify the sender immediately and then delete it from your system. Please be advised that the views and opinions expressed in this e-mail may not reflect the views and opinions of Associated Newspapers Limited or any of its subsidiary companies. We make every effort to keep our network free from viruses. However, you do need to check this e-mail and any attachments to it for viruses as we can take no responsibility for any computer virus which may be transferred by way of this e-mail. Use of this or any other e-mail facility signifies consent to any interception we might lawfully carry out to prevent abuse of these facilities.

Associated Newspapers Ltd. Registered Office: Northcliffe House, 2 Derry St., Kensington, London, W8 5TT. Registered No 84121 England.